

This exam has three parts: I. Philosophical Technique (20 minutes)
II. Short Essay on Plato's *Republic* (25 Minutes)
III. Long Essay on Plato's *Republic* (45 minutes)

Part I: Philosophical Technique (20 minutes)

1. Warburton Entries.

(a) Consider the following argument:

- P1. Every student is either good or bad.
- P2. The bad ones can't profit from the teacher's help.
- P3. The good ones don't need the teacher's help
- C. Teaching is worthless.

What is the flaw of the first premise? _____

(b) Consider the following argument:

- A recent study by a Nobel Prize-winning geneticist showed conclusively that twins choose the same career more often than regular siblings do.
- Therefore, I infer, one's choice of career depends on genetics.

What is the flaw of this inference? _____

(c) Consider the following argument:

- P1. The Catholic Church's position on abortion was formulated during the time of the Roman Empire.
- P2. At this time, the Church adapted its moral positions to suit the whims of corrupt emperors.
- C. Therefore the Catholic Church's position on abortion is wrong.

What is the flaw of this argument, even if its premises are true? _____

2. Deductive Argument Forms, Weston 6.

Analyze the two arguments contained in the following adaptation of Plato, *Republic* 608e – 610e.

Socrates: Do you agree to this . . .

Glaucou: What?

Socrates: That the soul is either mortal or immortal?

Glaucou: Of course. It must be the one or the other.

Socrates: It's not mortal. Therefore, it's immortal.

Glaucou: Big deal. That's a valid deductive argument, but not very interesting.

Socrates: Why not?

Glaucou: You have not shown that the soul's not mortal.

Socrates: But I can, with a second argument.

Glaucou: Go ahead.

Socrates: Well, if it's mortal, then its characteristic vice would destroy it.

Glaucou: Its characteristic vice is injustice, as we agreed earlier.

Socrates: Right. And does injustice destroy the soul?

Glaucou: No, it just makes the soul unhappy.

Socrates: Therefore the soul is not mortal.

Glaucou: That does follow.

Socrates' First Argument:

(a) What form of deductive argument is this?

(b) How would you symbolize this argument, using a variable for each clause?

Socrates' Second Argument:

(a) What form of deductive argument does this approximate?

(b) How would you symbolize this argument, using a variable for each clause?

Part II: Short Essay (25 Minutes)

In a blue book, answer one question from the following list.

1. What are three important analogies that Socrates exploits in order to advance his argument in the *Republic*. Are there any relevant differences between the two things being analogized? (Do not use the Line or the Cave.)
2. How do the four sections of the Divided Line analogy match the stages of ascent from the allegorical imprisonment in the Cave.
3. What are the four degenerate types of city? Characterize each one and the way it arises from its predecessor as a city declines.
4. In Book 3 Socrates makes one argument about competent judges; in Book 9 he makes another. What are these arguments? What are the differences between them? Are they ultimately consistent or inconsistent with one another?
5. Discuss a few ways in which the character of Socrates and the *Republic* as a work of prose either exemplify Plato's philosophy or contradict it, or both.

Part III: Long Essay (45 minutes)

In a blue book, answer one of these two questions.

1. Show how Plato's ontology (his theory of Forms) affects his theory of knowledge (epistemology), theory of pleasure, and theory of art. Try to recall specific arguments that demonstrate this influence. What is an objection to Plato's ontology that calls all of these other theories into question?
2. What is Thrasymachus' definition of justice? How is this definition an implicit critique of justice? In Book 1, which arguments does Socrates marshal against this critique? What are the flaws in these arguments? In Book 9, Socrates marshals new arguments against Thrasymachus' critique. Are these new arguments any better? Present and evaluate at least the first of them.