Mid-Semester Paper Critique Form

Your Name___________________________  Paper's Author___________________________

How long is the draft?________pages (handwritten or typed?)

***

Does the author correctly answer the five questions? If not, what is not correct and why?

Does the paper accurately summarize Aristotle’s position and bring out “explicitly what he thinks people are responsible for and why (and what he thinks people are not responsible for and why)”? Yes or No  On what page(s) of the draft does the summary appear?  Are extraneous details included or crucial details omitted?  If so, please explain:

Does the paper accurately characterize the objection (at 1114b) to Aristotle's view?  Yes or No  On what page(s) of the draft is his view characterized?  Are extraneous details included or crucial details omitted?  If so, please explain:

Has the author considered how Aristotle’s theory -- and the objection to it -- are related to the commonly accepted idea that those who are insane, and those who are severely disabled mentally, are not responsible for their actions?  Yes or No  On what page(s) of the draft is his view characterized?
Does the paper make clear precisely what aspect of Aristotle’s theory is at stake? Please offer some advice as to how the author might make the objection and its importance clearer.

Does the paper offer a plausible response on Aristotle's behalf? What is that response? Mightn't it be strengthened? How?

Has the author made clear what he or she thinks of the adequacy of Aristotle’s resulting view and why? What do you think of what he or she thinks? What is the best argument you can think of against the view the author holds?

Offer some constructive criticism of the paper. That is, to the extent the paper itself is unclear, help to clarify it; to the extent the arguments offered in it are not compelling, try to bolster them; to the extent there is an important counter-argument not considered by the author, explain it; and to the extent the author has misunderstood the theories and positions relevant to the assignment, help him or her to understand it.

Suggest, in concrete terms, some ways to improve the style and presentation of the paper.